

October 17, 2023

The Honorable Richard Durbin
Chair
United States Senate Committee on the Judiciary
224 Dirksen Senate Office Building
Washington, D.C. 20510

The Honorable Lindsey Graham
Ranking Member
United States Senate Committee on the Judiciary
224 Dirksen Senate Office Building
Washington, D.C. 20510

**Re: Seth Robert Aframe, Esq.,
Nominee for the United States Court of Appeals
for the First Circuit**

Dear Chair Durbin and Ranking Member Graham:

I write this letter to you in support of Attorney Seth R. Aframe, who has been nominated to serve as a judge on the Court of Appeals for the First Circuit. I have known Attorney Aframe for approximately 13 years, and I have enormous respect for his integrity and intelligence, and his abilities as a lawyer. I recommend him for the position enthusiastically and wholeheartedly.

I was the Chief of Appeals for the United States Attorney's Office ("USAO") in Boston for over 20 years. In that capacity, I supervised all the criminal, asset forfeiture (civil and criminal), and non-administrative habeas (civil) appellate work of that office, and I also served on the Department of Justice's Appellate Chiefs Working Group in Washington, D.C. I came to know the work of all the federal prosecutors handling appeals on a routine basis in the Court of Appeals for the First Circuit (their abilities as both brief writers and oralists), regardless of the district in which they practiced. I also worked closely with the appellate chiefs of the other offices on significant issues and with the appellate lawyers in the Department of

Justice's Criminal Appellate Division. I organized moot courts for my office and appellate training programs that were open to other USAOs and to the public. Perhaps because of the length of time in which I held that position, or perhaps because the District of Massachusetts has the largest caseload in the circuit, judges and Department of Justice staff would periodically contact me if there was a problem with the way a case from another district was being or had been handled. In light of all of this, I feel that it is safe to say that I had a good sense of the practices of federal prosecutors handling appeals in the First Circuit.

I feel confident in stating unequivocally that Attorney Aframe's research, writing, and oral argument skills are exceptional. He is careful about the facts and law, ethical, knowledgeable, thoughtful, level-headed, and fair. I also believe he has the respect of judges and other court personnel and the bar in general. I periodically sought out Attorney Aframe to help with moot courts on difficult cases in my office and often sought his advice on issues that would have institutional impact. I have the highest regard for his knowledge and judgment.

I also believe him to be committed to the public good, to the justice system, and to civics and civic-minded behavior. After I retired from the USAO, I launched a program called "Civics 603" under the umbrella organization of NH Civics (a New Hampshire nonprofit that provides civics education to New Hampshire residents). In Civics 603, students in grades 5 through 8 handle mock trials in fictitious cases presenting interesting social issues and students in grades 7 through 12 present mock appellate arguments in landmark U.S. Supreme Court cases. In the last three years, Attorney Aframe has volunteered frequently to judge the trial and appellate programs, and I am delighted to report that he is in demand. By this, I mean that returning teachers who participated previously in a program where Attorney Aframe presided will often request his participation in upcoming programming. His questions to students are always thoughtful and right on point, and he has just the right style and demeanor with the students. He is able to simultaneously challenge and encourage them, facilitating deeper analysis and more meaningful dialogue. After the presentations, Attorney Aframe always offers constructive feedback and interesting insights about the legal system. He is a natural educator and a true gentleman.

I hope Attorney Aframe will be confirmed. The public, the court, and the legal system will be very well served.

Please feel free to call me with any follow-up questions. I am happy to answer them. My telephone number is 603-235-0258.

Very truly yours,

/s/ Dina Michael Chaitowitz

Dina Michael Chaitowitz
6 Dublin Road
Windham, New Hampshire 03087
(603) 235-0258