



OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT

P.O. Box 1773
Carlisle, PA 17013-2896

717-245-1322 *phone*
www.dickinson.edu

July 7, 2023

The Honorable Richard Durbin
Chairman
Committee on the Judiciary
United States Senate
Washington, D.C. 20510

The Honorable Lindsey Graham
Ranking Member
Committee on the Judiciary
United States Senate
Washington, D.C. 20510

Dear Senators Durbin and Graham,

I am writing in enthusiastic and unqualified support of my former colleague, U.S. Magistrate Judge Karoline Mehalchick. As you know, her nomination by the President is now before the Judiciary Committee on which you serve as Chair and Ranking Member.

I have known Judge Mehalchick for over twenty years, first as an able lawyer who practiced before me, and later as a colleague after she was duly selected by my court to serve as one of our Magistrate Judges. In the former role, Judge Mehalchick was known for her superb ability and striking intellect. Moreover, her time as counsel was hallmarked by involvement in many initiatives that advanced the legal profession, including leading our district's Federal Bar Association. In the latter role as Magistrate Judge, where I developed a very close relationship with Judge Mehalchick, she has been exceedingly successful. She works hard, moves her cases, impresses all with her temperament, and writes brilliantly. Judge Mehalchick is devoted to the Rule of Law and is passionate about her work.

The greatest appellation that I can award to a fellow jurist is that she is a "judge's judge." This fits Judge Mehalchick perfectly. Quite candidly, over my almost twenty years on the federal bench I was saddened to see some of my colleagues develop what is known in the judging business as "black robe disease". This has never been the case with Judge Mehalchick. While she is well aware of her position and authority, and uses both wisely, she has never forgotten her roots. Judge Mehalchick possesses a great deal of confidence, but runs her court with a light touch and a winning sense of humor. The very best judges are imbued with patience and a firm memory of how difficult it is to practice law. Judge Mehalchick has these qualities in abundance.

During my final year as Chief Judge of the Middle District of Pennsylvania, I served in tandem with Judge Mehalchick when she assumed the position of Chief Magistrate Judge. She did so seamlessly, and among the several regrets I have about retiring from the bench is that I am unable to work with her as fellow chief judges. She quickly exhibited both leadership skills and innovative ideas that have served my former court well.

The Honorable Richard Durbin
The Honorable Lindsey Graham
July 7, 2023
Page two

Finally, Judge Mehalchick is of exemplary character in every respect. As I am sure you can discern, I could not possibly provide a higher recommendation in support of a nominee before your committee. If the past is truly prologue, this nominee will distinguish herself as a U.S. District Judge.

Should you require further information, please do not hesitate to contact me. Thank you for your consideration of this recommendation.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "J.E. Jones III". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial "J" and "E", and the name "Jones III" following.

Hon. John E. Jones III (ret.)
President, Dickinson College